Unjust hierarchies (according to the class)	Just hierarchies (according to the class) that
that fit Anderson's criteria for unfree	fit Anderson's criteria for unfree
Slavery	i. Parental power over young children
Male power over women (including female	ii. Teacher power over young students
disenfranchisement)	iii. U.S. military
Husband having power over wife	iv. Prison (if "properly" run, and in a
Nazi military	just nation)
Caste system (when this includes hierarchy	v. Democracy (depending on how we
of power)	interpret Anderson's view)
Schools with age or SES-based hierarchy	vi. Hierarchies within Congress

Version 1

If a power structure is *hierarchical* and inferiors do not give morally relevant consent to the structure, and (a) (inferiors have no say in the orders they are given, no say in who their superiors are, nor any way of redressing complaints about most orders), or (b) (superiors can issue orders about private/personal aspects of the inferiors' lives, or issue arbitrary orders about the inferiors' behavior), then that power structure is unjust.

• (i) - (vi) are counterexamples

Version 2

If a power structure is hierarchical, and <u>inferiors are competent</u> but do not give MRC, and (a) and (b), then the power structure is unjust.

• (iii) – (vi) are counterexamples.

Version 3

If a power structure is hierarchical, and inferiors are competent but do not give MRC, and (a) and (b), and there is a better alternative, then the power structure is unjust.

• Can Anderson accept version 3 of this conditional, and still think that all companies in the U.S. (that have employees) contain unjust power structures?

Defective desires and adaptive preferences

defective desires: desires the oppressed have for that which is oppressive to them, rather than for what they would desire were they not oppressed

adaptive preference formation: unconscious accommodation of desires to feasible options

2

Stockholm Syndrome: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=riwHaBHnTi0

Four conditions form the basis for the formation of the Stockholm syndrome: (i) perceived threat to one's physical or psychological survival at the hands of an abuser(s); (ii) perceived small kindnesses from the abuser to the victim; (iii) isolation from perspectives other than those of the abuser; and (iv) the inescapability of the situation [18]. (Cantor & Price, *Traumatic entrapment, appeasement and complex PTSD*, 379)

"Five core techniques for brainwashing: Isolation, control, uncertainty, repetition, emotion." (Taylor, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=skCoCaXryTY)

"Vasanti stayed for years in an abusive marriage... Like many women, she seems to have thought that abuse was painful and bad, but, still, a part of women's lot in life, just something women have to put up with as part of being a woman dependent on men, and entailed by having left her own family to move into a husband's home. The idea that it was a violation of rights, of law, of justice, and that she herself had rights that were being violated by his conduct - she did not have these ideas at that time, and many many women all over the world still do not have them....

"Or consider Jayamma... When women got paid less for heavier work in the brick kiln and denied chances of promotion, Jayamma did not complain or protest. She knew that this was how things were and would be... Again, when her husband took his earnings and spent them on himself in somewhat unthrifty ways, leaving Jayamma to support the children financially through her labor, as well as doing all of the housework, this did not strike her as wrong or bad, it was just the way things were, and she did not waste time yearning for another way. Unlike Vasanti, Jayamma seemed to lack not only the concept of herself as a person with rights that could be violated, but lacked, as well, the sense that what was happening to her was a wrong."

(Nussbaum, Adaptive preferences and women's options, 68-69)

- 1. Are there examples in which someone acts on the basis of a defective desires and/or an adaptive preference, and seem to you to be acting non-autonomously (or not giving MRC)?
- 2. Are adaptive preferences, or defective desires, autonomous or not, by Crisp's standards?
- 3. State a conditional that articulates when and why defective desires are not autonomous.